

Exploring the Impact of Interactive Pedagogies on Self-Confidence and Tolerance among University Students

Bilal Shaukat ¹

ABSTRACT:

The aim of the research is to determine how students' self-confidence and tolerance levels in teacher-centred learning environments relate to one another. By using both quantitative and qualitative data, the relationship between the variables was determined. The Concurrent Triangulation Method (CTM) was used in conjunction with the Mix Method Research (MMR) technique to conduct the investigation. Ten focus group conversations were used to gather qualitative data, while an existing interpersonal tolerance measure was used to obtain quantitative data. Student self-confidence has a Pearson chi-square value of 66.738 and a p-value of .004, whereas classroom activities have a Pearson chi-square value of 78.768 and a p-value of .005. Both the qualitative and quantitative statistics demonstrate that kids who are self-assured exhibit a high degree of tolerance. The majority of teachers are too preoccupied with lecturing the class to provide proper attention to the reading, discussion, Q&A period, and student presentations, all of which have a negative impact on the students' tolerance levels. Students find it difficult to comprehend the diverse behaviours of others in such situations. Students would be more tolerant the more questions they asked, and the teacher allowed them to ask.

KEY WORDS:

Self-confidence, (In)Tolerance, Classroom Activities, Higher Education Institutes (HEIs), Learner/Teacher-centred Approach

¹ Lecturer, Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies, University of Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.

Email: bilalshoukat@uop.edu.pk

Corresponding Author: Bilal Shaukat

✉ bilalshoukat@uop.edu.pk

Cite this Article:

Shoukat, B. (2024). Exploring the Impact of Interactive Pedagogies on Self-Confidence and Tolerance among University Students. *The Regional Tribune*, 3(1), 1-10.

<https://doi.org/10.63062/trt/V24.014>

Introduction

The alternative educational model that Freire (1997) suggested, which discourages memorization and mechanical learning in favour of discussion and problem-solving techniques, will serve as the standard for this study. Universities are known for fostering critical thinking skills in both instructors and students, as well as building self-confidence (Shoaib & Ullah, 2021a). For the purpose of data analysis, the ideal learner is one who is guided to attain tolerance, moderation, and humanity; this learner serves as the benchmark for existing students and teachers (Shoaib & Ullah, 2021b). The primary goals of education are to develop students' capacity for inquiry, questioning, and thinking as well as to boost their self-esteem through dynamic curricula and critical pedagogies (Shoaib et al., 2024b). In order to connect theoretical knowledge with practical actions, teachers urge their students to use critical thinking skills (Justice et al., 2008). To foster critical thinking and comprehension in students, the classroom should be dynamic, introspective, participatory, and educational (Aliakbari & Faraji, 2011; Mehta & Pandya, 2017).

Students replicate what they know and recreate their ideas and observations in real life, making them the future of both nature and culture (Shoaib et al., [2024](#); Shoaib et al., [2024a](#)). The instructor instils confidence in the pupil to participate actively and creatively in discussions and debates (Giroux, [1997](#)). They teach students how to challenge the dominant powers in society and the classroom, as well as how to learn from and understand one another in a mutually beneficial way (Shoaib, [2024b](#), [2024c](#)). Accepting opposing viewpoints, expanding one's genuine knowledge via important experience (Shoaib, [2024a](#)), and feeling accomplished with objectivity and clarity all contribute to the development of independent thought (Arshad, Anwar, & Shoaib, [2024b](#)), self-improvement (Arshad et al., [2024a](#)), and self-confidence (Anwar et al., [2024](#)). Additionally, self-assurance fosters critical criticism (Anwar et al., [2024](#)), self-learning (Ali et al., [2024](#)), creativity, liberty of speaking and writing (Shoaib et al., [2023](#)), enjoyment of the novel (Shoaib et al., [2023](#)), obligation to share information with others (Shoaib et al., [2023](#)), and obligation to find (Mehta & Pandya, [2017](#)).

Teachers serve as facilitators or guides for students on their journey of understanding and inquiry (Shoaib et al., [2023](#)), not forcing them to take on new experiences that would conflict with their social identities or group identities (Shoaib, [2023b](#)). When debate, critical thinking (Shoaib, [2023a](#)), and the dissemination of learning experiences are promoted in the classroom (Ullah et al., [2022](#)), students feel more independent and confident (Moate & Cox, [2015](#); Wright, 2011). Instructors encourage their students to pursue independent learning from their own opinions (Shoaib et al., [2022](#)) and be independent of other students or teachers (Shoaib et al., [2022](#)). Students determine the direction of learning since these kinds of activities are crucial to their self-actualization and confidence in their ability to understand the significance of their experiences (Shoaib et al., [2022](#)) and find answers to the concerns that have been bothering them (Abdullah et al., [2012](#)).

Additionally, inclusive education fosters critical thinking (Shoaib et al., [2022](#)), increases self-assurance (Shoaib et al., [2022](#)), and empowers young people to question (Mariam et al., [2022](#)) and assess the information they are taught as well as take into account their opinions and choices (Kausar et al., [2022](#)). The rote memorizing method of orthodox and religious doctrine, in general, is not supported by these counterarguments. Education emphasizes the acceptance and appreciation of the Quran for plurality and existence here on this earth in an effort to challenge the monolithic and bigoted doctrines of extremist groups professing to embody Islam.

Counter-extremist skills are developed by the attributes of student-centred education, which include forgiveness, diversity acceptance, active engagement, compassion, and tolerance (Anwar et al., [2022](#)). Enhancing the relationship between students and teachers improves these skills in three ways: (a) by encouraging more student interaction and communication; (b) by changing the way teachers approach civic rights, gender equality, delegation of authority, and respect for diversity; and (c) by emphasizing the importance of getting students involved (Anderlini et al., [2017](#)).

The Data and Methods

The study was carried out at the University of Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Data was collected through mixed-method research using the current triangulation technique. Both quantitative and qualitative data were collected simultaneously to validate the results that self-confident students are more tolerant. Focus groups were used to gather qualitative data through discussions, while an existing interpersonal tolerance measure was used to collect quantitative data. The group of students for both data sets was the same. Qualitative data was analyzed with different themes and sub-themes, including the original inscription of students' opinions, while quantitative data was evaluated using the Pearson chi-square with 56 degrees of freedom. Research philosophies such as interpretivism and pragmatism are employed in the evaluation of qualitative information and the mix technique, respectively.

Results

The three Cs of education are critical thinking, creativity, and confidence in oneself. Making students feel secure in the classroom is one of the key goals of the learning process. Students who possess self-confidence are able to voice their opinions in public and provide a convincing argument for their theories. Teachers have a responsibility to help pupils develop self-confidence. Knowledge is useless without sharing it, and sharing is made feasible by self-assurance. Students with self-confidence have more options in their practical lives later on. They will thrive in the market if they have self-confidence; if not, they won't.

Sharing Experiences

Everybody perceives life in a different way from other people. These encounters differ from both the teachers' and the books' perspectives. The personal experiences of both teachers and students are crucial to the learning process. It is impossible to learn without firsthand experience since it brings academic concepts to life and aligns them with students' real-world circumstances. In order to help students feel more confident, teachers exhibit curiosity about their personal experiences. However, learners also feel proud of their teachers and believe that they are interested in their lives and experiences. One of the most important sources of information is personal experience, and students' confidence is increased when they share their experiences.

"We are not encouraged by our teachers to voice our opinions in front of the class. We receive criticism that we are incredibly inept at comprehending even seemingly simple things and that we haven't learned anything at all if we communicate a concept improperly or incorrectly. Our teacher makes us feel too miserable to engage in class activities. Students do not develop self-confidence from them."

According to a student, the majority of teachers dissuade their pupils from expressing their opinions on the matter. Teachers believe that sharing their experiences is a waste of time, and sharing them leaves them with less time to finish the course. The only pupils who are allowed to speak in class are the teachers; all other students are expected to remain silent.

Encouraging for Questions/Discussion

Encouragement of inquiries can help pupils feel more confident. Regardless of the quality of their arguments, students are encouraged to participate in class discussions and ask questions in order to feel more empowered to speak up in front of the class. The majority of students are bright and comprehend the material, but they are too shy to discuss it with their peers. Their confidence will grow the more they talk in class. They will speak effectively once they overcome their timidity.

"Students never gain confidence from a teacher. When a student answers a question incorrectly, the teacher makes fun of him; on the other hand, when a student provides the correct response, they receive encouragement and recognition. This explains why, even when they are unfamiliar with the material, the majority of students do not contribute to the conversation or ask the teacher questions."

Within the framework of teacher-centred education, the role of the teacher in both learning and instruction is fundamental and dominant (Shoaib & Ullah, [2021a](#)). Pupils participate in class activities in a passive (Shoaib & Ullah, [2021b](#)) and submissive manner and have little to no opportunity to ask questions (Shoaib et al., [2021](#)). Students are not permitted to express themselves or talk about their experiences. When it comes to creating knowledge, pupils using this educational technique fall short of their objectives (Mpho, [2018](#)).

Equal and Co-Partnership

As was previously noted, teachers and students participate as equal partners in the educational process in the classroom. When teachers treat their pupils equally and help them understand that they are co-partners in the

learning process, students become more confident. The teacher plays a critical role in helping students develop their confidence because they have the power to both increase and decrease it. Students who are self-assured treat their teachers with respect and collaborate with them in the classroom, making their jobs easier. After the instructors get them back on course, students will be on their own both in the classroom and in their practical post-university lives.

"We don't gain more confidence in college; in fact, we already lost it." I can speak from my experience when I say that after asking a question and receiving a response that made me feel embarrassed, I never again ask questions even when I don't know the answer—instead, I keep quiet and find out from other sources.

According to the research, university students lack confidence and find it difficult to communicate their observations with their peers (Shoaib et al., [2021](#)). In contrast, a student-centered approach fosters confidence in students by providing them with unique ways for them to participate actively in debate and discussion. (Giroux, [1997](#)). They teach students how to challenge the dominant powers of society and the classroom, as well as how to learn from and understand one another in a mutually agreeable manner (Aliakbari & Faraji, [2011](#)).

Expressing One Own Thought

Everybody has a number of creative ideas that could not only improve their own lives but also benefit society as a whole (Shoaib et al., [2021](#)). Nevertheless, the majority of these ideas stay inside one's head rather than being expressed and shared with others as information is shared. Students who are self-assured communicate their ideas and opinions, regardless of whether they are right or incorrect, but offer an alternative perspective. They do not just copy the actions of others; rather, they apply reason to determine whether to accept or reject certain arguments.

Their choices are the result of consideration and evaluation rather than a heist. The main character in the educational setting and an engaged contributor to the conversation and debate is self-assurance. Because of their involvement and activity, self-assured students are typically close to their instructors and other authoritative figures. Repetitive sharing also refines thoughts.

"Students in the last semester are very much afraid of doing a presentation and expressing their thoughts in front of the entire class in the presence of teachers. There is no difference in assurance between students from the first semester to the sixth semester."

Referring back to the previous sentence, the educational institution did not give the pupils a platform that would have increased their self-confidence. A few students participating in the conversation expressed the opinion that confidence levels drop when a student enrolls in a university (Shoaib et al., [2021](#)). Empirical findings, however, demonstrate that student-centred education not only fosters academic success but also increases learners' self-confidence by encouraging openness to new experiences and fostering an environment that values diversity and allows for the compassionate application of concepts in real-world contexts (Shoaib et al., [2021](#)). The teacher's contribution to these accomplishments is crucial in getting pupils to think critically (Marinko et al., [2016](#)).

Innovative and Peculiar Ideas

Talking to teachers and fellow students not only boosts one's self-esteem but also allows one to share one's unique and creative ideas with others. Most innovations are initially frowned upon, but as time passes, people come to value them. Students who possess self-confidence are more inclined to think critically about problems and use their creativity to come up with novel ideas.

"Lack of confidence to share our own tales in the midst of the class, and occasionally we even realize that our experiences don't matter to other people or that my experiences don't matter or have any worth to other people. I believe that the inability to discuss everything with our peers is an issue for us."

The statement demonstrates that students are unable to discuss their experiences with teachers when they are in the classroom. Nonetheless, debate and discussion foster the exchange of creative concepts and the student's overall learning (Shoaib et al., [2021](#)). Teachers and students must practice and acquire particular abilities in order to have a conversation about the students' confidence. (Scharf, [2016](#)).

Belief in Knowledge

The most crucial factor in fostering self-confidence is having faith in one's own abilities and knowledge. People will not succeed in their lives if they have broken faith in themselves. Whether a strong belief is right or incorrect, it is what elevates one to the top; it is the belief in knowledge that brings success. Most of the time, students are aware of the right response, but they are often hesitant to respond to the instructor in the centre of their peers because they are unsure if their response is accurate.

The conventional understanding of knowledge is binary, meaning that all information falls between yes and no, regardless of whether the response is right or incorrect. There is no fundamental "yes" or "no" in human existence; instead, we exist in a world of yes and no. Teachers ought to instil in their pupils the idea that information is malleable and subject to change as time and location do. But in order to bring about change, people need to communicate and impart their expertise.

Even though it is the sixth semester, we are not allowed to address the class in direct view of the board. Although presenting is a required component of the semester system, we chose not to do so because the instructor felt that the course could not be finished with such activities. In spite of this, our course was never finished, and they continue to follow the curriculum whether or not we comprehend it. As a result, there is no presentation and, thus, no self-assurance.

In order to construct their understanding via in-class instruction and instructor facilitation, students are given additional time and attention. Through problem-posing education, they investigate fresh and creative approaches to problem-solving. Higher education students require more self-reflection in order to fully comprehend the problem (Shoaib et al., [2021](#)). Under the guidance and assistance of teachers (Shoaib, [2021](#)), they actively participate in all types of learning activities, including planning, observing, assessing, and evaluating (Abdullah et al., [2012](#)).

Self-respect

Every person, regardless of age, gender, socioeconomic status, authority, degree of knowledge, etc., has the right to self-respect (Mariam et al., [2021](#)). Because they believe that pupils are ignorant, certain instructors in the classroom dissuade learners from participating in the conversation or asking questions. Occasionally, similar discouragements are delivered in such harsh and demeaning ways that the kids' personalities and self-respect are totally destroyed. A student whose teacher has destroyed their sense of self-respect will never be able to regain it, and as a result, their confidence is destroyed. In the learning environment, where they are treated with no respect by the teacher, students are reluctant to speak out, participate actively in the conversation, or ask thoughtful questions. Consequently, a teacher ought to treat everyone with respect.

"A teacher's goal is for students to become confident, and this instructor has nothing to worry about the students' self-confidence." One of the reasons why students' confidence may decline is because of their peers. When a kid approaches teachers with questions or initiates a discussion to improve his learning, his peers mock him and make fun of him.

The outcomes of focus group talks demonstrate that teachers in the classroom do not value the opinions of their students. They occasionally act aggressively when someone poses a question or presents an alternative argument.

Decline Shyness

One of the main obstacles preventing pupils from developing self-confidence is shyness. Students that are shy are inherently confused and hesitant to engage in activities. They are afraid that their peers or teachers would make fun of them if they voice their opinions in front of the class. Students that are shy seldom take the initiative to try anything new. They lack confidence, therefore they rely on others to complete their tasks.

"I believe that teachers play a big part in helping students gain confidence. A small percentage of students in a class may possess a high degree of confidence, and when professors choose to consult with these students alone, the confidence of the remaining students may suffer. I believe that students are not instilled with confidence by their teachers. In order to help shy children become more confident, teachers should encourage them to participate in activities and include them in discussions.

During the focus group discussion, it was observed that while all of the students had a similar level of confidence, some were more outgoing than others. With a few exceptions, most educators do not, however, help children overcome their shyness by including them in various classroom activities and fostering a sense of confidence in them (Anwar et al., 2021).

Students' Proudness

When participating in all activities in the classroom, children who are self-assured feel proud of themselves. They take the lead in activities and serve as the discussion moderator. When a self-assured student asks a question, engages in arguments and discussions with teachers, and possesses excellent communication skills that persuade others of their knowledge, other classmates are impressed by the person. They feel proud of themselves and are inspired to be active by this self-assurance. The idea that "practice makes a man perfect" allows them to overcome their shyness and become a confident, fearless member of the class. They clarify their comprehension by asking questions, but they also do so to help other students who would not ask questions of their lecturers.

"We are less confident than our opponents at other colleges, and they have more real-world experience in the corporate world than we do. This makes me feel less assured. I am uncertain about our future when we visit the marketplace with such assurance. I had an internship, and the initial couple of days were really difficult for me because they asked me a lot of questions, to which I gave negative answers, shattering my confidence. As a result, after the initial days, I started to feel confident and began working. I now believe that our lack of confidence during our time in college was a waste.

Learners evaluate themselves with those of other universities when they are in college. According to the findings, when university students compare themselves to other students, they lack confidence in their understanding and abilities. Their confidence is destroyed and they feel less confident if they lack information and skill.

Table 1
Bi-variate analysis of the independent variable is self-confidence, and dependent variable is intolerance.

S. No	Independent variable	Pearson Chi-square value	df	p-value
1	Self-Confidence of Students	66.738	56	.004
2	Classroom Activities	78.768	56	.005
3	Questions/answer session	66.289	56	.001

The focus group discussion's qualitative data reveals that students' levels of confidence are quite low in college, and some even stop having the same level of confidence they did before enrolling. Pupils can contribute to the conversation by being confident in themselves and sharing their knowledge; otherwise, information is meaningless. These pupils have a high degree of cold tolerance, as evidenced by the quantitative data. The Pearson chi-square

values with degree of freedom and point probability—66.738, 56, and .004—are displayed in the table under discussion. The sceptical pupils make an effort to stay away from those who have values that diverge from their personal beliefs and do not make an effort to understand other people's points of view by placing themselves in their shoes.

The relationship between university classroom activities and students' cold tolerance is depicted in the above table. With the dependent variable being cold tolerance, the Pearson chi-square test value for class activities is 78.768 with a degree of freedom of 56 and a probability point of .005. Both qualitative and quantitative statistics demonstrate how classroom activities impact university students' tolerance levels. The majority of teachers are preoccupied with giving a lecture to the class, and they pay lesser consideration to the text being read, student presentations, discussion, and Q&A period. In such circumstances, students find it difficult to comprehend behaviour that differs from their own.

For the questions and answer session, the Pearson chi-square test value is 66.289, with a degree of freedom of 56 and a probability point of .001. A high correlation between the inquiries and responses session and cold tolerance is indicated by the p-value. Students would be more warmly tolerant the more questions they asked and the teacher was allowed to ask. The focus group discussion's qualitative data reveals that most university professors discourage their students from asking questions because they believe it takes up valuable class time and will cause them to fall behind in finishing the course within the allocated time.

Conclusion

The ability of pupils to ask questions, put forth fresh ideas, engage meaningfully in debates and conversations, share personal experiences, and have confidence in their own abilities is referred to as self-confidence. A self-assured student opens up to the class about their personal experiences, participates actively in discussions and debates both within and outside of the classroom, and offers creative solutions that foster tolerance. These kids have a great sense of self-respect and a firm trust in their knowledge. Students' confidence is severely impacted by a lack of debate and discussion. Because they believe the instructor is the only source of knowledge, the majority of pupils accept the teacher's opinion without question or dispute.

References

- Abdullah, M. N. L. Y., Osman, S. B., Shamsuddin, M. A., Yusoff, M. S. B. & Ismail, H. N. (2012). Student-Centered Learning (Scl) Approaches for Innovative Teaching. Centre for Development of Academic Excellence (CDAE), Universiti Sains Malaysia (USM).
- Ali, R., Zaman, M. A., & Shoaib, M. (2024). Trends of Research Visualization of Gender Inequality, Equality, and Equity: A Bibliometric Analysis from 1981 to 2020. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(8), 237–252. <https://pjlw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/v3i8-237-252>
- Aliakbari, M., & Faraji, E. (2011). Basic Principles of Critical Pedagogy. *International Proceedings of Economics Development and Research (IPEDR)*, 17(2011), 77-85
- Anderlini, S.N., Cowick, D. & Holmes, M. (2017). Education, Identity and Rising Extremism From Preventing Violent Extremism to Promoting Peace, Resilience, Equal Rights and Pluralism (PREP). *International Civil Society Action Network (ICAN)*. <https://icanpeacework.org/2017/09/education-identity-rising-extremism/>
- Anwar, B., Shoaib, M., & Mustafa, R.-e.-. (2022). Factors Influencing Students' Willingness to Use Academic Library after COVID-19 Lockdown. *International Information & Library Review*, 35(2), 136-142. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10572317.2022.2089528>
- Anwar, B., Shoaib, M., & Shahid, U. (2024). Academic Performance of the Students in Higher Education in Pakistan: The Role of Information and Communication Technology. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 8(2), 472-482.
- Anwar, B., Shoaib, M., & Zahra, N. (2021). English Language Learning Skill at Tertiary Level: The Role of Classroom Environment and Interactive Demonstration. *Pakistan Journal of Language Studies*, 5(1), 1-17. [https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2024\(8-II-S\)41](https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2024(8-II-S)41)
- Anwar, B., Shoaib, M., Zaman, M. A., & Arshad, H. K. (2024). English Language Learning Practices in Classroom Environment: A Systematic Review. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(7), 267–284. <https://pjlw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/v3i7-267-284>
- Arshad, H. K., Anwar, B., & Shoaib, M. (2024a). Nexus of Classroom Environment and English Language Learning Skills in Higher Education in Pakistan. *Qlantic Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(3), 58-67. <http://dx.doi.org/10.55737/qjss.336091511>
- Arshad, H. K., Anwar, B., & Shoaib, M. (2024b). Teaching Spaces in Pakistan: A Case of English Language Learning Skills at Tertiary Level. *Qlantic Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 5(3), 71-80. <http://dx.doi.org/10.55737/qjssh.579341510>
- Giroux, H. A. (1997). *Pedagogy and the Politics of Hope: Theory, Culture, and Schooling*. A Critical Reader. West view Press.
- Justice, C., Rice, J., & Warry, W. (2008). Developing useful and transferable skills: Course design to prepare students for a life of learning. *International Journal for Scholarship of Teaching and Learning*, 3(2), 1-19. <http://dx.doi.org/10.20429/ijstl.2009.030209>
- Kausar, N., Manaf, A., & Shoaib, M. (2022). Suicidal Ideation among Adolescents: A Case of Bullying Victimization and Emotional Intelligence. *OMEGA - Journal of Death and Dying*, 003022282211201. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00302228221120123>
- Mariam, S., Anwar, B., & Shoaib, M. (2022). English for Specific Purposes: An Evaluation of 8Th Class Textbook of English. *Jahan-e-Tahqeeq*, 5(2), 112-119. <https://jahan-e-tahqeeq.com/index.php/jahan-e-tahqeeq/article/view/631>
- Mariam, S., Anwar, B., Shoaib, M., & Rasool, S. (2021). Literacy and Numeracy Drive: An Evaluation of Class Three English Textbook of Punjab. *Journal of Critical Reviews*, 8(2), 938-946. <http://dx.doi.org/10.31838/jcr.08.02.97>
- Marinko, I., Baužienė, Z., Daniels, N., Gołębiowski, A., Hughes, J., Kairienė, V., Knyviene, I., Maj, G.P., Marcinkiewicz-Marszałek, K. Marinko, J., Perkumienė, D., & Rees, A. (2016). Empowering teachers for a student-centered approach Mednarodna poslovna šola Ljubljana. Erasmus, European Union.

- Mehta, U., & Pandya, S. (2017). Relevance of Educational Thoughts of Paulo Freire: Perceived Meaning and Essence in the Indian Context. *International Journal of Advanced Research in Education & Technology (IJARET)*. 4(2), 78-86. <https://www.ijrpr.com/uploads/V2ISSUE7/IJRPR602.pdf>
- Moate, R. M., & Cox, J. A. (2015). Learner-Centered Pedagogy: Considerations for Application in a Didactic Course. *The Professional Counselor*. 5(3), 379–389. <http://dx.doi.org/10.15241/rmm.5.3.379>
- Mpho, O. M. (2018). Teacher centered dominated approaches: Their implications for today's inclusive classrooms. *International Journal of Psychology and Counselling*, 10(2), 11-21. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5897/IJPC2016.0393>
- Scharf, A. (2016). *Critical Practices for Anti-Bias Education. Teaching Tolerance*. A Project of the Southern Poverty Law Center. <https://www.learningforjustice.org/sites/default/files/2019-04/TT-Critical-Practices-for-Anti-bias-Education.pdf>
- Shoaib, D. M., Anwar, D. B., & Rasool, D. S. (2022). Factors Affecting EFL Teaching Skills at Higher Education Institutions in Pakistan: An Analysis of Teachers' Perspective . *Pakistan Journal of Language Studies*, 6(1), 1-15. <https://pjls.gcuf.edu.pk/index.php/pjls/article/view/156>
- Shoaib, M. (2021). *Sociological Analysis of Teachers Perspectives on Students Academic Performance in Higher Education in the Punjab*. [PhD Thesis]. International Islamic University Islamabad, Central Library.
- Shoaib, M. (2023a, September 22). *Galvanising Bourdieu's typology with Pakistani education and social class*. The Nation.
- Shoaib, M. (2023b, December 05). *Gender Differences in Academic Performance*. The Nation.
- Shoaib, M. (2024a, January 09). *Gender Disparity in Education*. The Nation.
- Shoaib, M. (2024b). Gender Diversity and Inclusion in Higher Education in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(1), 207-222. <https://pjlw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/v3i1-207-222>
- Shoaib, M. (2024c). Gendering Bourdieu's Cultural Capital in Higher Education in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(2), 265-278. <https://pjlw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/v3i2-265-278>
- Shoaib, M., & Ullah, H. (2021a). Classroom Environment, Teacher, and Girl Students' Learning Skills. *Education and Urban Society*, 53(9), 001312452110019. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00131245211001908>
- Shoaib, M., & Ullah, H. (2021b). Teachers' perspectives on factors of female students' outperformance and male students' underperformance in higher education. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 35(3), 684-699. <https://doi.org/10.1108/ijem-05-2020-0261>
- Shoaib, M., Abdullah, F., & Ali, N. (2021). A Research Visualization of Academic Learning Skills among Students in Higher Education Institutions: A Bibliometric Evidence from 1981 to 2020. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 5579, 1-34. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/5579/>
- Shoaib, M., Ahmad, A., Ali, N., & Abdullah, F. (2021). Trend of Research Visualization of Learning, Classroom, and Class Participation in Higher Education Institutions: A Bibliometric Analysis from 2001 to 2020. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 5743, 1-26. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/5743/>
- Shoaib, M., Ali, N., Anwar, B., & Abdullah, F. (2022). Library services and facilities in higher education institutions during coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in Pakistan. *Journal of Information Science*, 1-14. Shoaib, M., Ali, N., Anwar, B., & Abdullah, F. (2022). Library services and facilities in higher education institutions during coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in Pakistan. *Journal of Information Science*, 1-14. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/01655515221141035>
- Shoaib, M., Ali, N., Anwar, B., & Shaukat, B. (2021). Plotting the Literature on Learning Outcomes and Academic Performance in Higher Education from 2001 to 2020: A Scientometric Analysis. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 5919, 1-24. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/5919/>
- Shoaib, M., Ali, N., Anwar, B., Rasool, S., Mustafa, R.-e., & Zici, S. (2021). Research Visualization on Teaching, Language, Learning of English and Higher Education Institutions from 2011 to 2020: A Bibliometric

- Evidences *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 5677, 1-27.
<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=10464&context=libphilprac>
- Shoaib, M., Ali, R., & Akbar, A. (2021). Library Services and Facilities in Higher Education Institutions in Pakistan: Satisfaction of Patrons. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 1-19.
<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/6721/>
- Shoaib, M., Ali, S. R., & Abbas, Z. (2024). Self-Fulfilling Prophecy of Learning Skills Among Students in Higher Education. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(7), 164-177.
<https://pjlw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/v3i7-164-177>
- Shoaib, M., Anwar, B., & Mustafa, R. (2022). Moral Literacy and Islamic Values among Students at Tertiary Level. *Al-Āfāq Islamic Research Journal*, 2(2), 1-11. <http://alaafaqjournal.com/index.php/alaafaq/article/view/67>
- Shoaib, M., Fatima, U., & Jamil, R. (2021). Academic Library and Students' Learning at University Level: Nothing is Pleasanter than Exploring a Library. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 1-19.
<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=13577&context=libphilprac>
- Shoaib, M., Iqbal, S., & Tahira, G. (2021). Digitalization of Academic Libraries in Higher Education Institutions during COVID-19 Pandemic. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 1-15.
<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/6376/>
- Shoaib, M., Mustafa, R.-E.-, & Hussain, K. G. (2022). Revisiting Classroom Environment and Academic Performance of the Students in Higher Education Institutions. *Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, 4(3), 969-986. <http://dx.doi.org/10.52567/pjsr.v4i03.1279>
- Shoaib, M., Mustafa, R.-E.-, & Hussain, K. G. (2023). Citing the Empirical Shreds of Electronic Evidence on Pedagogical Skills Employing Bibliometric Analysis from 2001- 2020. *Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, 5(2), 1050-1062. <http://dx.doi.org/10.52567/pjsr.v5i02.1217>
- Shoaib, M., Rasool, S., & Anwar, B. (2021). Evaluating Research Support Facilities to University Students during COVID-19. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 4953(1), 1-18.
<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/4953/>
- Shoaib, M., Rasool, S., Anwar, B., & Ali, R. (2023). Academic library resources and research support services to English teachers in higher education institutions. *Journal of Electronic Resources Librarianship*, 35(1), 17-27. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/1941126X.2023.2165240>
- Shoaib, M., Shehzadi, K., & Abbas, Z. (2023). Contemporary Research on Learning Spaces and Teacher Effectiveness in Higher Education. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 2(03), 352–369.
<https://pjlw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/v3i2352369>
- Shoaib, M., Shehzadi, K., & Abbas, Z. (2024a). Inclusivity and Teachers' Aptitude in Higher Education in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(6), 219-237.
<https://pjlw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/v3i6-219-237>
- Shoaib, M., Shehzadi, K., & Abbas, Z. (2024b). Inclusivity, Teacher Competency, and Learning Environment at Higher Education: Empirical Evidences. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(5), 244-261.
<https://pjlw.com.pk/index.php/Journal/article/view/v3i5-244-261>
- Shoaib, M., Tariq, M., Shahzadi, S., & Ali, M. (2022). Role of Academic Libraries in Online Academic Activities during COVID-19 Outbreak at Tertiary Level: A Library is a Thought in Cold Storage. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 1-19. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/6998/>
- Shoaib, M., Usmani, F., & Abdullah, F. (2023). Plotting The Literature On Social Work Education From 1971-2020: A Scientometric Analysis. *Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, 5(2), 1347-1360.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.52567/pjsr.v5i02.1360>
- Ullah, H., Shoaib, M., Ali, N., & Ullah, R. (2022). Digital Research Support Services during COVID-19 Pandemic: An Analysis of the Higher Education Institutions. *Journal of Electronic Resources Librarianship*, 34(2), 121-134.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/1941126X.2022.2064118>