

The Politics of Sexual Violence and Subhuman Conditions: The Case of Bosnia and Rwanda

Marina Tovar¹ & Leo S.F. Lin²

¹ Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Email: mtovarvelasco@gmail.com

² University of Southern Mississippi, Email: w951096@usm.edu

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Article History:

Received:	July	15, 2022
Revised:	July	25, 2022
Accepted:	August	15, 2022
Available Online:	August	25, 2022

Keywords:

Sexual Violence; Subhuman conditions; Bosnia; Rwanda; War crimes

JEL Classification Codes:

O15, O47, R13

This paper examines the subhuman conditions of two critical war cases in Bosnia and Rwanda involving massive sexual violence. The rape of women by soldiers during wartime is considered an unfortunate accompaniment of war. Most scholars in war studies depart their research from a state-centric view rather than from a human security perspective. Therefore, This paper aims to investigate the role of rape and the politics of sexual violence in arms conflicts through the lenses of the "subhuman" theory. The authors seek to shed light on how women raped in war acquire the condition of "sub humans," where they do not have their rights and voices heard and do not exist in the legal framework of any state. Using the theoretical framework offered by the "subhuman" theory, this paper analyses two case studies - the Serbian militia's rape campaign in Bosnia in the 1990s and the mass rape of Tutsis in Rwanda in 1994. The paper concludes that both cases have exemplified that the military conflicts created acutely vulnerable conditions, which resulted in massive sexual abuse and violence against women. This paper concluded that in the two cases illustrate that subhuman conditions appear at the individual (women victims) and collective (the entire community) levels that we need to pay attention to capture the bigger picture of the incidents.



© 2022 The Authors, Published by (TJLSS). This is an Open Access Article under the Creative Common Attribution Non-Commercial 4.0

Corresponding Author: w951096@usm.edu

INTRODUCTION

Historically, sexual assault against women was considered an almost inevitable by-product or a collateral consequence of conflict. Explanations of using rape as a means to political and military ends (Porter, 2019) have always been present in the literature. With that, theories ranging from feminist approaches to macro-sociological analysis have contributed to the discussion. In this article, we aim to introduce the Subhuman Theory by Uddin (2020) to not drive the focus on why this phenomenon is produced but rather to understand the reality women

found in this situation experiment and how their lives acquire a condition of "subhuman" in extremely vulnerable conditions and almost deployed from existence. Therefore, we aim to put women, as individuals, at the centre to understand why they acquire the state of subhuman and why this is produced in conflict situations. To exemplify this, we will analyse the Serbian militia's rape campaign in Bosnia in the 1990s and the mass rape of Tutsis in Rwanda in 1994. The two cases studied allow us to clearly illustrate that the Uddin conditions described in the theoretical framework apply. That is why we can affirm that if the five conditions are fulfilled, the women who were victims of the crimes mentioned above fall under the category of "subhumans", as Uddin identifies them. In the two cases studied, we see that through the evidence of rape, which in both cases is documented and is an irrefutable reality, these events lead to these conditions being met.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The literature has discussed extensively regarding rape and war. For example, Danjiibo and Akinkuotu (2019) examine how rape has been used in armed conflicts and used the Boko Haram conflict as a case study. Wood (2018) offers a typology for all forms of political violence concerned with conflict-related rape. Copelon (2018) examines the legal status of rape in war from a gender perspective. There are many theoretical approaches to analysing the phenomenon of rape as a weapon of war. A comparative proposal from the point of macro-sociology is presented by Baron & Straus (1987) as a proposal to analyse and understand why rape is produced. Nevertheless, other approaches like the biological theory by Thornil (1999), masculinity and war by Ferguson (2022), proposals coming from the feminist theory like Cahill (2001) and Polaschek & Ward (2002) and even from psychology with Baumeister et al. (2002) are valid to analyse these events. This article aims to draw a new theory onto the debate, the Subhuman Theory by Nassin Uddin (2020).

The Subhuman Theory is a theoretical approach that allows us to comprehend the individuals who are individuals forced to live in acute marginalised and atrocious conditions (Uddin, 2020). Uddin argues that those who fall under the category of subhumans are found in extreme vulnerability, often known by scholars as those whose lives are taken for granted. Uddin argues that for an individual to be considered a subhuman must comply with the five essential features that subhuman life includes: 1) atrocious living conditions, 2) illegal objects in a legal framework, 3) homeless at home as there is nowhere to go, 4) a condition in which the subject is always vulnerable to being killed, raped and burnt and 5) a life deemed fit for extinction (Uddin, 2020). These five conditions need to be analysed in further depth to expand on the characteristics and implement them in the case studies chosen for this paper.

According to Uddin (2020), these atrocious living conditions force individuals to leave, as the place where they are located or born is unliveable. Concepts like "atrocious" and "unliveable" are definitions that might vary according to the individual. The unlivable conditions, which Uddin calls "atrocious living conditions," force the targets, in this case, raped women, into a state of vulnerability. Therefore, for Uddin, when individuals experience an "extreme form of atrocity perpetrated by state institutions or the agents that render the place", these are atrocious living conditions when individuals experience "an extreme form of atrocity perpetrated by state institutions or the agents that render the place" (Uddin, 2020). Regarding the second condition, Uddin argues that individuals are reduced to legal entities instead of human beings, extracting their humanity and being easy to treat inhumanely. Legal recognition in the normative framework helps frame "illegal objects" concepts to understand subhuman life (Uddin, 2020).

As the third condition, Uddin emphasises that individuals are left shelter-less as the governmental institutions deny them the right to live where they previously did. Therefore,

under such circumstances, "when people practically feel they have no place to go and no space for justice, they become hopeless and helpless" (Uddin, 2020). Following this, individuals are found in constant vulnerability, which could lead to situations where rape and death are present. The violence of governmental institutions or agents against statelessness or subhumans can include being burnt, raped, or killed. The fourth characteristic that Uddin describes is the convergence of the previous three ones as being deprived of access to justice, no right to live where you were born with atrocious living conditions, leaving individuals under being deprived of access to justice and having no right to live where you were born with atrocious living conditions leave individuals in a constant state of vulnerability. Finally, according to Uddin (2020), subhuman lives are considered worthy of extinction as the social position in which they are placed "denotes a particular form of life which lacks the basic amenities for survival" (Uddin, 2020).

Uddin's conditions of the subhuman theory fit the experiences women experiment with when being raped in wartime. "Seldom prosecuted and rarely denounced" sexual assault of women in conflict has been considered collateral damage rather than a violation of humanitarian law (Farwell, 2004). The lack of effective prosecution of rape in conflict situations; according to Farwell, lack of effective prosecution of rape in conflict situations generates an "implicit tolerance by military and political leaders". Accepting rape as an unavoidable consequence of wartime can normalise these situations and, therefore, create repetitive consequences that target women, an already vulnerable collective in society. In the following sections, we will apply the five conditions of Uddin's theory to the Serbian militia's rape campaign in Bosnia in the 1990s and the mass rape of Tutsis in Rwanda in 1994.

Finally, the research will be driven by the following question: Are Uddin's conditions fulfilled on in the case scenarios, and can women raped be considered "subhumans"? We will divide the two case studies into three paragraphs to respond to answer the research question. First, by introducing the historical and political context, we will understand the context that led to the events that created the mass rape campaigns. Then, in the following section, we will examine the evidence of rape in terms of number and the systematic use and use of the data in the last section by analysing Uddin's conditions and if these apply to the case study.

METHODOLOGY

This paper used comparative case studies by using historical qualitative research methods. This approach is designed to understand and explain how the case of Bosnia and Rwanda can be examined from the subhuman perspective. This approach is appropriate as it enables the readers to understand and compare the similarities of two historical cases that contain subhuman conditions. The authors collected and analysed secondary data and grey literature, including books, journal articles, newspapers, and internet sources.

Rwanda: The mass rape of tutsis in 1994.

Historical and Political Context

There is currently a widespread discussion in the literature about the origins of Tutsis and Hutus. On the one hand, it is argued that in Rwanda, there was a slow migration of Tutsis to the territory, and later, the Hutus arrived (Newbury, 1995). On the other hand, another hypothesis highlights a slow but steady migration and that these two groups are not different but established as two different castes of the same population. When Rwanda was under Belgium's rule as a colony, very clear mechanisms of differentiation were established between the two ethnic groups with ID cards to identify Tutsis and Hutus when these entities previously had some flexibility (Newbury, 1995).

This inter-ethnic tension increased until the 1959 Rwandan Revolution, which led to Hutu-driven independence with an anti-Tutsi component. During this revolution, crimes committed by Hutu militants were detected, either in the form of massacres or by burning houses of Tutsis (Newbury, 1995). After the revolution, a group of Tutsis who emigrated and took refuge in the country armed themselves and created the Rwandan Patriotic Front (RPF) to launch attacks and take control of the country's northern region. Following the signing of a ceasefire in 1993, the assassination of the Rwandan president took place on 6th April 1994, triggering a genocide prepared in advance and fueled by hate speech to eliminate all Tutsis carried out by the provisional Rwandan government, which lasted three months (Newbury, 1995).

Regarding the role and the status of women in Rwandan society, despite article 16 of the 1991 Rwandan Constitution ensuring equality among the two genders, it has been proven that women "have been long subjected to a wide array of limitations and restrictions that have discriminated them in profound and systemic ways" (Human Rights Watch, 1996). In this line, Rwandan women have been subjected to protection by a male relative, either by their husband or protected by their father, centring their role not as an individual but rather around the figures of mother and wife. Therefore, in the context of political tensions, women were an especially vulnerable group that would suffer the consequences of the genocide.

Evidence of Rape

The Rwandan genocide has a gendered component as women were more likely to receive "mercy" from the militia killers at the expense of surrendering themselves sexually to their captors (Jones, 2002). Most of the women who were killed, according to Jones (2002), were in three different contexts: the women were direct family members of Tutsi or Hutu men targeted, and they were swept up in the "root-and-branch" genocidal massacres in the first weeks of the Genocide, or they were killed, together with younger girls and elderly women, as the only remaining Tutsis after the killing against males had been largely completed.

Even though several studies have been conducted, there is no exact figure on the number of gender-based crimes or rapes committed during the Rwandan Genocide, even though "testimonies from survivors confirm that rape was extremely widespread" (Human Rights Watch, 1996). A report conducted in January 1996 by the UN Special Rapporteur on Rwanda estimated that between 250.000 and 500.000 cases of rape were conducted. Nevertheless, what has to be noted is that "rape was the rule and its absence, the exception" (Human Rights Watch, 1996). The difficulty of accurately documenting the sexual violence during the Rwandan genocide was due to several factors. Worldwide, rape victims are stigmatised and ashamed of the crimes committed against them; therefore, rape has become one of the least reported crimes. As elsewhere, rape victims in Rwanda have been reluctant to publicly disclose part of the reasons for their rape out of fear of rejection and humiliation, no matter how unworthy it was, for themselves and their families.

Uddin's conditions in Rwanda

Throughout the Rwandan case, both men and women experienced Uddin's conditions of Subhumans. Nevertheless, we will expand on the consequences women suffered due to gendercide and the role rape played in determining the extinction of the Tutsi ethnicity. Firstly, Uddin's "atrocious" and "unliveable" conditions forced raped women into a state of vulnerability. It was proven that women experienced mutilation of their breasts and vaginas together with being poured acid and boiling water on their vaginas or cut open pregnant women's wombs, among others (D'Arville, 2017). Therefore, when Uddin argues that

subhumans experience "extreme forms of atrocity perpetrated by the state institutions or the agents that render the place", it is applicable in the Rwandan case. The gendercide was committed by military men, the elite, professors, priests, and peasants. Therefore, it is committed by the institutions and those in power, following Uddin's first condition.

Regarding the second condition, Uddin argues that individuals are reduced to legal entities to treat them inhumanely. With the conditions that we have previously commented on, the massive rape campaigns and the normalisation of this phenomenon throughout the genocide prove that women were reduced to more we have previously commented on, the massive rape campaigns and the normalisation of this phenomenon throughout the genocide prove that women were reduced to objects and treated inhumanely. The third condition is also fulfilled in this case as there is a lack of effective prosecution of the crimes committed and impunity of the perpetrators. Uddin argues that subhumans are left shelter-less as the institutions deny them the right to live or space of justice, becoming hopeless and helpless (Uddin, 2020). Despite having mechanisms to effectively prosecute the perpetrators of the crimes at a national and international level, women fear pointing out the men who raped them as they will likely be separated and shamed by their communities. In this sense, when there is a lack of testimonies and specific numbers of crimes committed, the victims will lack spaces for justice, as subhumans do under the third condition Uddin describes.

The fourth condition Uddin describes is a constant vulnerability state the first three conditions set that are likely to lead to situations where rape and death by governmental institutions are committed. The fourth condition is proven and is the central one as the previous section, "evidence of rape," establishes the documented rapes and crimes that Tutsi and Hutu women suffered during the Rwandan genocide. Expanding on that, it has to be noted that rape and other crimes can fall under the Genocide Convention categories. For example, acts of sexual mutilation that cause serious bodily or mental health harm "intended to destroy a group" may be prosecuted under subsection (b) of Article 2 of the Convention (United Nations, 1951). Furthermore, under specific circumstances, crimes of sexual violence could be prosecuted "under subsection (c) and (d) of Article 2" of the Convention as the calculation of a group's physical destruction to prevent births by cutting the womb of pregnant women, for them to not to give birth, could also be prosecuted (Human Rights Watch, 1996).

Finally, the fifth condition is also fulfilled as the gendercide in 1994, as genocidal rape "attempts to eliminate a population through violence and systematic rape" (D'Arville, 2017). Subhumans, according to Uddin, are considered worthy of extinction, denoting their lives are not worthy of continuing, being their lives lack the basic amenities for survival. It has been proven that acts of genocidal rape and sexual violence toward women became a "routine tool to dominate and destroy Tutsi women" (D'Arville, 2017). Therefore, in the Rwandan case studied, women were the primary victims of the genocide because they were not only killed in numbers equal to, if not exceeding, those of men but also were raped, massacred, and subjected to other brutalities (Jones, 2002).

Bosnia - Case Study

Introduction and Severity of the Case

The severity and enormity of sexual violence can be gauged from the fact that it has been recognised as a war crime and genocide. Being a serious issue humanity is facing desperately warrants certain definitions here. The World Health Organization defines sexual violence as the acts that culminate in verbal harassment and forced sex that encompasses the forms and manifestations of coercion, social pressure, intimidation and physical force. According to

Sexual Violence Research Initiative (SVRI) Sexual violence refers to any attempt or sexual act that signifies sexual abuse directed against the sex victims. (Van Zyl, et al).

Moreover, it is defined as a form of gender-based violence ranging from sexual acts, attempts, unwelcome sexual comments and advances that target the sexuality of a hapless person in a myriad of coercive forms in any environment or setting. The forms and manifestations of sexual violence include rape, sexual abuse, sexual slavery, forced circumcision, castration, and forced nudity. Ironically, sexual violence becomes more than a crime and more than a humiliation of humanity in wartime. The civilised world has put in place regulatory and legal policy policies and actions to discourage the scourge of sexual violence. For instance, the United States of America (USA) explicitly regards rape in wartime as punishable by death or imprisonment under Article 120 of the United States Uniform Code of Military Justice and Section d(g) of the War Crimes Act 1996. Nevertheless, sexual violence speaks volumes regarding Bosnia in the context of history (Ten Bensel & Sample, 2017).

Historical and Political Context

In the 1990s, amidst the Bosnian war, sexual violence was mercilessly committed as a rape mass rape campaign by the inhuman Serbian militia. By and large, it was a policy systematically crafted against Muslim women wherein the Bosnian Serb forces of the Army of the Republika Srpska (VRS) and Serb paramilitary units stimulated all the ethnic groups to commit rape against the hapless women (Morus,2010). Serbian militia used this as a weapon of terror, intimidation and ethnic cleansing.

The intensity and extensity of this sexual violence during this ill-fated decade can be gauged from the verdict of The International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY), declaring it "systematic rape" and "sexual enslavement" and a war waged against the entire humanity (Sackellares, 2005). Political experts regard this sage as genocidal rape against female Bosniak carried out by the Serb Militia: VRS. Dragoljub Kunarac, a member of VRS, was thus convicted of using this mass campaign as part and parcel of the weapon of war, the first-ever such international court verdict. Amnesty International deemed this genocidal and ethnic cleansing as pre-planned, premeditated and a deliberate military strategy used shamelessly by Serbian militia (Sackellares, 2005). Political forces during this decade were second to none (Golubovic, 2020) in unleashing sexual violence against Bosnian women and children.

In 1989, Serbian president Slobodan Milošević used to ignite the misdirected national sentiments. The political speeches badly used misinformed and exaggerated tales, such as a small fraction of the Bosnian people allegedly under Ustaše used to persecute some Serbs amid world war second as descendants of Turks (Hall,1999). This political and military combined effort even went to the extent of announcing to speakers the ill consequences to face if Serbs acted to protect Bosnian women and children from sexual violence. Common Serbs were threatened by the militia to be killed if they were found to protect the voiceless and hapless Bosnian women and children from the militia's uncontrolled onslaught (Grosscup, 2003). This environment of fear and awe led towards fear and awe led to looting, killing, and attacking Bosnians. Women and children were separated and onwards were put in concentration camps.

Evidence of Rape

There is widespread and well-documented evidence of sexual violence against Bosnian women and children. It is estimated that from 10,000 to 50,000 women were raped during the decade by the Serb militia, paramilitary and other designated military units (Weitsman, P. A. 2008). However, such a number could exceed since there were unreported cases of sexual violence

owing to many reasons. In addition, this evidence is strengthened by award-winning films and documentaries that present rapes and sexual violence. UNHCR Report claims that the total number of rapes was 12,000.

On the other hand, estimates by the European Union European Union reveal that 20,000 women were raped then by the Serb militia. In contrast, the Interior Ministry of Bosnia reported rape cases totalling a staggering one,50,000 (Arce,2000). However, the UN Commission of Experts reported over a thousand sexual violence cases (Sivakumaran, 2010). Nevertheless, "rape camps" were set up by the Serbian military forces wherein women were repeatedly raped till they became pregnant. Then there is hair-raising evidence of rape when Muslim women were raped publicly in front of villagers and neighbours, and such cases of rape were in plethora as well (Benard, 1994). The designated Experts of the UN Commission found that the high command of Serb forces supported this bestiality of rapes, humiliation and sexual violence, said M. Cherif Bassiouni. Cherif Bassiouni as chairman of the Commission. The Commission further revealed that orders of rape were issued by the command of the Serb militia (Zacklin, 1993). Pregnant women were detained until it was too late to abort the fetus. The Commission further unfolded:" rape has been reported to have been committed by all sides to the conflict. However, the largest number of reported victims has been Bosniaks, and the largest number of alleged perpetrators has been Bosnian Serbs. There are few reports of rape and sexual assault between members of the same ethnic group." There is yet evidence shared in 1993 by the European Community member Simone Veil Simone Veil and Anne Warburton Anne Warburton as investigators of the sexual violence of Bosnian women (Banjeglav, 2009). The stamp of approval of the rape evidence is placed by the women survivors who told them they wanted to implant the seeds of Serbs in Bosnia in them women survivors who told them they wanted to implant the Serbs' seeds in Bosnia through rape and humiliation. One of the victims shares the evidence in these words: "You are going to have our children. You are going to have our little Chetniks". Last but not least, in eastern Bosnia, a mass grave is excavated that reveals that women were detained and raped repeatedly by the Serb militia (Engle, 2005).

Uddin's conditions in Bosnia

In its entirety, the Bosnia case fulfils Uddin's conditions of subhuman theory experienced by women, children, and even men. Throughout the 1990s, Serbian militia under state patronage committed sexual violence and sexual abuse against women. The state apparatus and senseless Army of the Republika Srpska army of the Republika Srpska (VRS) and Serb paramilitary units ignited others to rape Muslim women and get revenge for the past (ENE,2020). Uddin's condition of "atrocious" and "unlivable" subjected the hapless women to a subhuman condition "atrocious" and "unlivable" condition subjected the hapless women to a subhuman condition, rendering them vulnerable, prone, and susceptible to inhumanity. Under one of Uddin's conditions, "extreme forms of atrocity perpetrated by the state institutions or the agents that render the place," in the Bosnia case, both the president and Serb militia were in unison and connivance to unleash as much atrocity as possible Alvarez, A. (2006). Mass murder graves during excavation, breasts being cut, and pregnancies being forced are in cynic with this condition of Uddin.

The second condition of Uddin, that individuals are reduced to mere objects and are treated inhumanly, can be relied upon in the Bosnia case of sexual violence and inhuman treatment (Engle, 2005). Women were subjected to rape, and from 10,000 to 50,000 women were raped before the eyes of their family members and neighbours. The Serbian military forces set up gang-raped and "rape camps" where women were repeatedly raped until they became pregnant. The Muslim women t reduced to the status of toys and objects and were detained in the atrocious camps until their pregnancies were mature and they could not have the fetus aborted

(Ten Bensel & Sample, 2017). As the Commission reported, his condition is further corroborated here that all sides of the conflict committed this rape campaign.

Concerning the third condition of Uddin that the victims do not receive justice through the mechanism of criminal justice systems nationally and internationally and war crimes are committed with impunity, and the perpetrators of war roam freely after committing atrocious crimes (Edman, 2008). This condition is fulfilled in the Bosnia case as well. Except for Ratko Mladić, none of the perpetrators has been convicted. Hence, in Uddin's words, these women are rendered shelterless, and the state justice machinery and legal institutions fail to provide them with even-handed, dispassionate and independent justice (Ginn, 2013). By and large, this is a dilemma; for instance, how can the 50,000 women who suffered furnish evidence in the social setting of shame and the fear of ominous consequences by the state institutions? Therefore, Uddin's condition of sheltering fewer victims and the institutional failure of the state rightly apply to Bosnia's Muslim women and children.

About the fourth condition of constant vulnerability, the state facilitated and precipitated by the three preceding Uddin's conditions that lead towards situations where rape and death by governmental institutions are committed is vividly reflected in the case of Bosnia. The people died and were raped systematically and in a pre-planned manner (Salzman, 1998). The state ignited them to kill, maim and rape. The Serbs were warned of irreparable consequences if any mercy was demonstrated for children and women. Death casualties were found in a plethora. The evidence of rape is an eye-opener of how mercilessly, systematically, and religiously they were killed and raped via gangs in open spaces and how mercilessly, systematically, and religiously they were killed and raped via gangs in open spaces and camps (Sharlach, 2000). Bosnia Interior Ministry reveals 50000 cases of rape that were reported during that decade. An excavated grave that showcases their atrocities of mass murder and mass rape (Skjelsbaek, 2006). This condition is fulfilled in the case a great deal since the three stated conditions culminate in deaths and rapes. The soldiers told them they were destined to bear their lineage, blood, and seeds of children as they were not allowed to abort their pregnancies (Daniel-Wrabetz, 2007). This situation speaks volumes, and the fourth condition is applied and fulfilled in the case.

The fifth condition of rape, "attempts to eliminate a population through violence and systematic rape," is fulfilled and can be fixed in Bosnia's rape, death, and humiliation scenario perpetrated by the Serb militia and the state institutions. The Bosnia case is genocide, race elimination, and a vantage point of inhumanity (Card, 2008). It can be termed as a racist moment as well since the militia was bent upon stamping out their race and lineage. The survivors of the torture and rape camps share their experiences that they were told that now it is the end of their race, and the seeds of their race via gang rape and open rape are implanted in them (Card, 1997). By minutely analysing, their systematic pregnancy moment was directed towards the goal of rooting out their race from the land as they were told that now they were destined to bear their little Chetnik. "You are going to have our children. You are going to have our little Chetniks" was the slogan of the state and Serbs militia. A race stamp-out campaign (ARSOC) was in full swing throughout the decade of injustice, rape, humiliation, and inhumanity in Bosnia decade of injustice, rape, humiliation, and inhumanity (Sitkin, et al, 2019). Men and children also bore the brunt, but old women were subject to rape, abuse, and humiliation in the open spaces, before family members and neighbours, and in the "Rape Camps" (Salzman, 1998). The breasts were cut; pregnancies were sustained forcefully to bear the children of their race. They were subjected to a perennial state of humiliation, atrocity, genocide, and inhumanity of various forms and manifestations (Clark, 2017).

CONCLUSION

This paper examined the two historical cases of Bosnia and Rwanda using Uddin's thesis, which provides a useful theoretical framework applicable to the role of rape in wars. This paper affirms that the two cases studied allow us to clearly illustrate that the Uddin conditions described in the theoretical framework apply. That is why we can affirm that if the five conditions are fulfilled in wars or any inter-state conflicts, the women who were victims of the crimes mentioned above fall under the category of "subhumans" as Uddin identifies them. In the two cases studied, we see the authors have provided relevant that through evidence of rape, which in both cases is documented and is an irrefutable reality, these events lead to these conditions being met.

In both case studies, the fourth condition of Uddin takes on great prominence from the victims because it is focused on the facts mentioned in the previous paragraph, which is the evidence of rape. In other words, Uddin's fourth condition stresses that subhumans are subject to the condition of vulnerability and suffer killings, rape and being burnt. Since our case studies focused on rape campaigns and even genocidal rape campaigns, the fourth condition that refers to this success gains prominence as this condition will always be fulfilled in these cases.

Finally, we must acknowledge that rape in most militarised conflicts usually has the purpose to intimidate or intimidating and torturing the enemy; in some specific cases can lead to targeting women and turn into genocide. In both cases analysed, we see this statement is fulfilled as rape did not only aim to torture the enemy but additional pain, abortions and other mutilations were inflicted on Tutsi or Bosnian women. Therefore, despite putting the focus of our research on the fulfilment of Uddin's conditions in the case scenarios, we must be acknowledged that rape, and especially those who are victims of these crimes, acquire the condition of subhuman and even mere objects, to the purpose to inflict pain on the enemy, while being those women who are raped, the ones that suffer the most. Future research should provide empirical evidence using primary data to further study the relations between rape in armed conflicts and subhuman conditions.

REFERENCES:

1. Arcel, L. T. (2000). Deliberate Sexual Torture of Women in War. In the International handbook of human response to trauma (pp. 179-193). Springer, Boston, MA.
2. Alvarez, A. (2006). Militias and genocide. *War Crimes Genocide & Crimes against Human.*, 2, 1.
3. Banjeglav, T. (2009). Gender, Nation, Rape: Intersections of gender and ethnic violence during the War in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Submitted to Nationalism Studies Program, Central European University, Budapest, Hungary.
4. Baron, L., & Straus, M. A. (1987). Four theories of rape: A macrosociological analysis. *Social problems*, 34(5), 467-489.
5. Benard, C. (1994). Rape as terror: The case of Bosnia. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 6(1), 29-43.
6. Clark, J. N. (2017). *Rape, sexual violence and transitional justice challenges: Lessons from Bosnia-Herzegovina*. Routledge.
7. Card, C. (2008). The paradox of genocidal rape aimed at enforced pregnancy. *The Southern Journal of Philosophy*, 46(Supplement), 176-189.
8. Card, C. (1997). Addendum to "Rape as a Weapon of War". *Hypatia*, 12(2), 216-218.
9. Copelon, R. (2018). Gendered war crimes: Reconceptualising rape in time of war. In *Women's Rights Human Rights* (pp. 197-214). Routledge.

10. Daniel-Wrabetz, J. (2007). Children born of war rape in Bosnia-Herzegovina and the Convention on the Rights of the Child. *Born of War. Protecting children of sexual violence survivors in conflict zones*, 21-39.
11. Danjibo, N., & Akinkuotu, A. (2019). Rape as a weapon of war against women and girls. *Gender and behaviour*, 17(2), 13161-13173.
12. Das, S., & Lin, L. S. (2021). The Rohingya: an ethnography of 'subhuman' life.
13. ENE, D. V. (2020). BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA–SEXUAL VIOLENCE AS WEAPON OF WAR. *STRATEGIC CHANGES IN SECURITY AND INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS*, 159.
14. Edman, A. J. (2008). Crimes of Sexual Violence in the War Crimes Chamber of the State Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina: Successes and Challenges. *Human Rights Brief*, 16(1), 5.
15. Engle, K. (2005). Feminism and its (dis) contents: Criminalising wartime rape in Bosnia and Herzegovina. *American Journal of International Law*, 99(4), 778-816.
16. Farwell, N. (2004). War rape: New conceptualisations and responses. *Affilia*, 19(4), 389-403.
17. Ferguson, R. B. (2021). Masculinity and war. *Current Anthropology*, 62(S23), S108-S120.
18. Ginn, C. (2013). Ensuring the effective prosecution of sexually violent crimes in the Bosnian war crimes chamber: Applying lessons from the ICTY. *Emory Int'l L. Rev.*, 27, 565.
19. Golubovic, J. (2020). Zones of violence: Serb women inside the siege of Sarajevo (Doctoral dissertation, Arts & Social Sciences: Department of Sociology and Anthropology).
20. Hall, G. O. (1999). The politics of autocracy: Serbia under Slobodan Milosevic. *East European Quarterly*, 33(2), 233.
21. Human Rights Watch (1996). Shattered Lives: sexual violence during the Rwandan Genocide and its Aftermath. Retrieved 9th January 2022 from <https://www.hrw.org/reports/1996/Rwanda.htm>
22. Jones, A. (2002). Gender and genocide in Rwanda. *Journal of genocide research*, 4(1), 65-94.
23. Morus, C. M. (2010). Violence Born of History/History Born of Violence: A Brief Context for Understanding the Bosnian War. In *The Development of Institutions of Human Rights* (pp. 65-81). Palgrave Macmillan, New York.
24. Newbury, C. (1995). Background to genocide: Rwanda. *African Issues*, 23(2), 12-17.
25. Sackellares, S. N. (2005). From Bosnia to Sudan: Sexual violence in modern armed conflict. *Wis. Women's LJ*, 20, 137.
26. Salzman, T. A. (1998). Rape camps as a means of ethnic cleansing: Religious, cultural, and ethical responses to rape victims in the former Yugoslavia. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 20(2), 348-378.
27. Sharlach, L. (2000). rape as genocide: Bangladesh, the former Yugoslavia, and Rwanda. *New Political Science*, 22(1), 89-102.
28. Sitkin, R. A., Lee, B. X., & Lee, G. (2019). To destroy a people: Sexual violence as a form of genocide in the conflicts of Bosnia, Rwanda, and Chile. *Aggression and violent behavior*, 46, 219-224.
29. Sivakumaran, S. (2010). Lost in translation: UN responses to sexual violence against men and boys in situations of armed conflict. *International Review of the Red Cross*, 92(877), 259-277.

30. Skjelsbaek, I. (2006). Victim and survivor: Narrated social identities of women who experienced rape during the war in Bosnia-Herzegovina. *Feminism & Psychology*, 16(4), 373-403.
31. Ten Benseel, T., & Sample, L. L. (2017). Collective sexual violence in Bosnia and Sierra Leone: A comparative case study analysis. *International journal of offender therapy and comparative criminology*, 61(10), 1075-1098.
32. Thornhill, R. (1999). The biology of human rape. *Jurimetrics*, 137-147.
33. Uddin (n.d.). Theoretical contributions. Retrieved 9th February 2022 from <https://nasiruddinbd.wordpress.com/theoretical-contributions/>
34. Uddin, N. (2020). *The Rohingya: An Ethnography of sub-human Life*. Oxford University Press.
35. United Nations (1951). Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide. Retrieved 9th February 2022 from https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/documents/atrocities-crimes/Doc.1_Convention%20on%20the%20Prevention%20and%20Punishment%20of%20the%20Crime%20of%20Genocide.pdf
36. United Nations (2022). *Rape as a War Crime | United Nations*. Retrieved 15th February 2022 at <https://www.un.org/en/chronicle/article/rape-war-crime>
37. Van Zyl, H., Dartnall, L., & Swanevelder, S. Sexual Violence Research Initiative: An evaluation.
38. Weitsman, P. A. (2008). The politics of identity and sexual violence: A review of Bosnia and Rwanda. *Human rights quarterly*, 561-578.
39. Wood, E. J. (2018). Rape as a practice of war: Toward a typology of political violence. *Politics & Society*, 46(4), 513-537.
40. Zacklin, R. (1993). Bosnia and beyond. *Va. J. Int'l L.*, 34, 277.